

INCLUSIVE NOT EXCLUSIVE



Notes from the roundtable meeting held 26 August 2016 to discuss Baroness McGregor-Smith's review of issues faced by businesses in developing Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) talent



Introduction

The Mayor of Bristol Marvin Rees and Councillor Asher Craig hosted a roundtable event on Friday 26 August 2016 to discuss the Government's BME2020 review with Baroness McGregor-Smith.

People from businesses, public and voluntary organisations were invited to the event. Approximately 50 people attended from a range of cultural backgrounds from across Bristol.

A live Twitter feed provided feedback and comments throughout the meeting and a press statement was released at the end of the event.

Participants were set a number of questions to discuss at the roundtable. There were 227 individual responses which reflect participants own personal experiences from a range of work settings. The key themes and comments are detailed in the following pages.

The final section outlines specific recommendations from the meeting for suggested action by business, Government, Bristol City Council and roundtable participants.

Appendices include the programme for the event, a list of participants and a copy of the press release issued following the event.



“All the evidence tells us that diverse organisations and places are better run and perform better, so it’s in Bristol’s best interests that we draw talent from all our communities. That’s not only the city council’s responsibility, but it is the responsibility of all organisations in Bristol. I am looking forward to working with partners to develop the leadership in the city that Bristol deserves.”

Marvin Rees, Mayor of Bristol

Marvin Rees, Mayor of Bristol, Baroness McGregor-Smith and Councillor Asher Craig

1 What are the impacts of having an ethnically diverse workforce?

Economic driver

A strong theme emerged from discussions that a diverse workforce is good for business. Participants felt that in the private sector, diversity brought an increase in profits and saving of costs. In the public sector, participants thought a diverse workforce gives better care and services for the population of Bristol as it represents the citizens it serves.

Participants' comments

- Economic justice results in resilient economy and enables sustainability.
- Diversity is a reflection of society – shouldn't everything we do reflect diversity?
- Better understanding of cultural impact on customers' preferences and therefore products/sales and services meet the needs of communities.
- Global market diversity means better engagement with global patterns.
- Introduce targets and measures to demonstrate impact on business, profit, improvement of services, and discretionary effort of employees on productivity.
- Diversity means business is agile to change and services/products are shaped through better understanding of market requirements.
- Public sector insight into cultural issues ensures a better prevention agenda, reducing spiralling costs and increasing quality of life for citizens.
- BME is a fast growing population (birth rate), we need to ensure there are jobs.

Example: Neighbourhood and Housing working with BME groups supported by management development programme to deliver the change.

Efficiency

Participants thought that diversity in the workforce made for increased efficiency through better team work and opportunities for development.

Participants' comments

- Diversity of thought produces enhanced solutions to challenges and problems.
- Diverse teams are good teams.
- Diversity of thinking enhances team work, producing greater efficiency.
- An inclusive approach sustains individuals through times of change.
- Making sure that the workforce understand the benefits of diverse talent will be critical in developing teams that are 'match fit' for the organisation, and at the same time manages manpower costs that are the major factor in balancing the books.
- Reduction in sickness rates through diverse team working.

Example: Reduction in infection and mortality in NHS as a result of diverse team working.

Reputation

The group felt that an organisation with a reputation for diversity in the workforce would encourage people to work there.

Participants' comments

- Diverse workforce impact on communities spreads the word and sells the organisation as a good place to work.
- Family and friends spread the word in communities that an organisation is a good employer.
- Future generations will be encouraged to work for an organisation that is recruiting and developing diverse talent.
- New generations of young talent will choose to work for an organisation with a reputation for cultural enlightenment and career opportunities. Those generations will shape services and products in an ever-changing social and economic climate.

Example: Providing a cultural (faith) calendar would demonstrate an understanding by employers that there is recognition of faith as an important contributor to employees' motivation, work and life balance.



2 Evidence suggests that BME individuals have difficulty accessing jobs or progressing as far as their white counterparts

Factors highlighted by participants were similar to the key factors highlighted in the review framework including:

- discrimination
- lack of role models
- lack of social or professional networks
- unconscious or conscious bias
- language.

Other factors identified by participants were as follows:

Recruitment

Participants' comments

- Some recruitment practices work against the selection of a candidate from a diverse background – advertisements, selection criteria, competencies, person specification and where the advertisement is placed factor out those from a diverse background.
- Representation on recruitment panels not diverse (unconscious bias). Some participants reported having seen examples of overt racism.
- Concern that in some workplaces, senior teams recruit those from similar background – which works against selection and career progression due to the small number of BME senior managers within organisations.
- Recruitment is difficult when managers do not understand, or do not have the skills to see the problem.
- Huge barrier to access jobs due to budget restraints. For example, if only advertised internally the pool from which to recruit is not diverse.

Example: KPMG increased BME recruitment by a third, after a review of processes for graduate and apprenticeship candidate recruitment.

The conversation

Participants' comments

- Bristol finds it hard to talk about race.

- Young ambitious BME people may leave the city to progress to senior leadership positions unless action is taken now.
- Where are the Roma people in the conversation?
- Don't forget young white working class male unemployed – they are also key disadvantaged citizens.

Media

Participants' comments

- Media does a poor job in including diversity and diversity role models.
- Enterprise partnerships – Bristol is diverse but doesn't have a reputation as being positive about diversity.

Power of role models

Participants' comments

- Role models are a key factor in accessing jobs and career progression.
- Case studies demonstrating successes and achievement are a positive factor in overcoming bias.

Example: The Mayor and Councillor Craig's leadership has been a huge boost to the BME community.

Role of schools and colleges

A consistent theme was the importance of education and celebration of achievement at early stages through to teenage years.

3 Which of the following policies and practices that support BME progression in the city are you aware of?

Feedback from participants highlighted the following:

- mentoring
- talent/fast-track programme
- unconscious bias training
- targeted internship/recruitment
- diversity/inclusion champions
- reverse mentoring
- BME networks
- Name-blind recruitment.

Most effective:

Participants' comments

- Mentoring, shadowing (largest response).
- Strong networks that are influential.
- Sponsorship – investing in the person – personal time not financial.
- Career progression and development (non-traditional, upwards and linear).
- Confidence and self-development.
- Use networks and sponsors to open doors to new opportunities.
- Use of vacancies as opportunity for internal development, rather than interims.
- Positive action – supported with skill and personal development.
- Recruitment and selection processes that have been reviewed for bias.
- Positive drive to advertise in non-traditional areas to reach wider population.
- Board development.
- Top leader commitment.
- Incentivise managers to develop staff with clear reporting.
- Talent management (cross-sector) and succession with diversity targets.
- Global academic and work experience opportunities.
- Social media and technology solutions.
- Unconscious bias/cultural awareness training.
- Analyse data to highlight areas for improvement.

- Schools and colleges promoting role models and good examples to bring to life opportunities.

Example: BCC Apprenticeship programme gives free bus pass for apprentices and pays living wage for year 2 apprenticeships.

Least effective:

Participants' comments

- Unless there is commitment to diversity at the top, policies and procedures will not make a difference.
- Without a fair, transparent and equal culture, aspirations of individuals (especially young) will be stifled leading to disillusionment and impact on retention of the most talented.
- Lack of diversity in recruitment, performance, career development and skill training programmes.
- Managers and 'group think' seen as a block to recruitment and development, regardless of policies and procedures.
- Bias plays a specific role in bad practice.
- Exit interviews fail to recognise and report to board on harassment and bias.

4 Recommendations for action

Participants identified a range of actions that Government, business and other organisations, and the council could consider to ensure diversity in the workplace.

Suggested actions for Government

Participants' comments

- Set targets and impact measurement to increase diversity improvement.
- Brexit – be positive. Provide leadership to assure and encourage.
- Model behaviour that demonstrates diversity of thought and workforce.
- Support and promote the economic and business imperative for businesses and public sector of employing a diverse workforce.
- Include diversity measurement in Government procurement practices and strategic policies.
- Change language on monitoring forms - don't ask race and ethnicity.
- Promote diversity in Parliament, Cabinet and civil service.
- Avoid negative media on culture, diversity and immigration.
- Promote role models and case studies.
- Set standards for education (all age groups) that include diversity and culture – as part of a multi-cultural society.
- Set targets to increase percentage of BME apprentices.
- Encourage pre and post-apprenticeship programmes to increase employment.
- Focus on policies that address the underlying layers that contribute such as poverty, housing, education, access to nutrition.

Suggested actions for business and other organisations

Participants' comments

- Produce metrics and measurements that can demonstrate the impact of a diverse workforce on bottom-line results.
- Embrace diversity at board level.
- Engage shareholders in diversity as a business imperative debate.
- Spread good practice across business and other sectors.
- Use role models and case studies as part of reports to shareholders, customers and employees.
- Promote social value and triple-line reporting as a way of opening up board discussion on people value rather than just financial balance.
- Influence professional bodies such as CBI; IOD; CIPD etc. to ensure representation of BME on boards, services, and promotional material.
- Succession and talent management process includes a diversity target and training support for BME individuals to feel confident in applying for internal promotion.
- Give good news stories to the media on successes in business as a result of diversity.
- Look at supply chain – encourage suppliers around diversity and equality (Modern Slavery Act).
- Enterprise – create spaces (hubs) and social capital (volunteers).
- LEP sector skills support diversity agenda and ensure communication strategy has right imagery.
- Wider Government agencies promoting diversity agenda through workforce and service level agreements for procurement etc.

Suggested actions for Bristol City Council

Externally

Participants' comments

- Promote role models within the council and across the city.
- Lead the establishment of a Bristol diversity talent pipeline across all sectors of Bristol, including work opportunities, shadowing, coaching/mentoring, skill development and career management support.
- Work with partners on establishing Bristol BME diversity networking opportunities.
- Establish a network of diversity and inclusion champions.
- Lead the establishment of a leadership development pathway across public and private sectors.
- Refresh and reshape BCC mentoring programme to lead a Bristol-wide mentoring facility for BME and young people, including reverse mentoring.
- Lead the development of new style work experience/shadowing for young people in Bristol and set BME local targets for participation.
- Work with academic, education and school partners to promote diversity at all ages/levels to increase diversity representation on courses, apprenticeships and jobs.
- Engage with communities.
- Work with business and other organisations on the business case for a diverse workforce, including impact measurement and local targets.
- Promote award winning apprenticeship programmes across Bristol as an exemplar of good practice and set targets to increase percentage of BME apprentices.
- Keep diversity on the agenda.
- Influence the media to promote positive images of a diverse workforce.
- Use social media to promote achievements and successes.
- Transport – encourage partners to have satellite workplaces to minimise travel, technology is key to outreach opportunities in communities.

Internally

Participants' comments

- Top leadership commitment to establishing a culture that is fair, transparent and equitable.
- Ensure diversity and inclusion is interwoven into culture transformation programmes.
- Incentivise managers to develop staff with clear reporting.
- Review and refresh current mentoring solution as a foundation for a pan-Bristol mentoring scheme.
- Review and reshape recruitment practices with external and internal selection for career progression.
- Establish talent pipeline with targets for BME participation at all levels.
- Utilise vacancies as career opportunities instead of the use of interims – immediate cost saving.
- Lead from the top – Mayor, Cabinet, CEO and officers – include feedback on diversity targets at SLT and Cabinet.
- Work with unions and staff representatives on improving diversity and inclusion.
- Review current policies and practices in the light of feedback from roundtable – identify areas of possible bias and take action to refresh and reissue practices.
- Review internal skills training access and set BME targets for participation.
- Establish internal diversity/inclusion champions.

Suggested actions for roundtable participants

- Become a mentor or a diversity/inclusion champion.
- Engage as a partner in the Bristol diversity talent programme.
- Encourage review of recruitment practices.
- Be a role model.
- Connect with communities.
- Spread the word, including through social media.

Appendix 1

Programme for 'Inclusive not Exclusive' – a roundtable discussion on issues faced by organisations in developing Black and Minority Ethnic talent.

12–12.30pm	Lunch and networking Welcome – <i>Councillor Asher Craig, Cabinet Member, Neighbourhoods</i>
12.30–12.4pm	Keynote address BME2020 Call for evidence – <i>Baroness McGregor-Smith</i>
12.40 –12.50pm	What does an inclusive city look like? – <i>Marvin Rees, Mayor of Bristol</i>
12.50–1pm	Dialogue scene setting – <i>(Prof) Christine Bamford, Councillor Asher Craig</i>
1–1.50pm	Round table discussion Questions: Q1. What works? Examples of good practice Q2. What are the blocks to employment and career progression? Q3. What are the benefits for employers to ensure a diverse workplace?
1.50–2pm	Emerging themes Inclusive not Exclusive – A force for change, and closing remarks – <i>Councillor Asher Craig</i>
2–2.30pm	Informal discussion and networking



Appendix 2

Participants List

Adam Powell

LEP

Alison Comley

Bristol City Council

Afzal Shah

Bristol City Council

Ann Marie Dixon-Barrow

Ann Marie Consulting

Anton Richardson

EE

Asher Craig

Bristol City Council

Christine Bamford

Professional Advisor

Cherene Whitfield

Bristol City Council

Claire Warnes

KPMG

Cliff Shaw

City of Bristol College

Carole Johnson

Bristol City Council

Esther Wride

Avon and Somerset Police

James Brereton

Bristol City Council

James Durie

Business West

Kalpna Woolf

Local Enterprise Partnership

Karen Drake

Engine Shed

Karen Richards

Department for Work and Pensions

Marie-Annick Gournet

University of the West of England

Martino Burgess

Gregg Latham Solicitors

Marvin Rees

Mayor of Bristol

Baroness McGregor-Smith

Chief Executive of Mitie

Monira Chowdhury

Well Spring Healthy Living Centre

Naush Akram

Antal

Peter Haigh

Bristol Energy

Nishan Canagarajah

Bristol University

Peaches Golding

Moon Consulting

Poku Pipim Osei

Babassa Youth Empowerment

Rebecca Hehir

Avon and Somerset Police

Ruben Ayo Eko

Graduate

Sam Fraser

South Western Ambulance Service

Simon Nelson

Bristol City Council

Steven Neill

University of the West of England

Tracie Jolliff

NHS

Veron Dowdy

Stand Against Racist Incidents

Tanya Edwards

Bristol City Council

Kurt James

Bristol City Council

Anne James

Bristol City Council

Darren Perkins

Bristol City Council

Edward Rowberry

Bristol & Bath Regional Capital CIC

Jenny Farman

Avon and Somerset Police

Erica Lockhart

Mitie, Executive Affairs Director

Suzan Backster

Mitie, Group Finance Director

Ann De Graffjohnson

University of the West of England

Shahzia Daya

Bristol City Council

Catherine Dodsworth

Avon and Somerset Police

Delano Gournet-Moore

Student

Sian Rees

Bristol Learning City

Ahmd Emara

University of the West of England

Amie Vaughan

Business West

Gillian Douglas

Bristol City Council

Appendix 3: Bristol City Council news release, 26 August 2016

City Hall seminar highlights issues businesses face in developing Black and Minority Ethnic talent

City Hall has played host to a seminar on the issues faced by businesses in developing Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) talent and support a government plan to increase BME employment by 20 per cent.

Marvin Rees, Mayor of Bristol, and Baroness McGregor-Smith were joined by representatives of the city's public, private and third party sectors to hear why they think BME individuals don't progress in their careers the same way as their white counterparts.

The Baroness has been asked by Said Javid MP, Secretary of State for Communities and Local Government, to lead an independent review to look at the obstacles faced by BME individuals when trying to progress at work. The views, experiences and insights shared by Bristol businesses at this meeting will inform the review and its findings.

Earlier this year the Secretary of State held a meeting of a new ministerial taskforce to call on ministers and business to engage with the Baroness' review. Bristol responded by inviting the Baroness to visit the city to discuss her review and hear the thoughts and experiences of local sector leaders.

The review's findings will be presented to the Secretary of State later this year and be used as a central piece of research for the Government's BME2020 plan – a vision for increasing BME employment by 20 per cent over the next four years.

Figures from the Department of Work and Pensions released in March 2016 showed that the annual rate of BME employment was 62 per cent whilst the White employment rate was 75 per cent.

Bristol has a diverse population with one in five residents and one in three schoolchildren from a Black or Minority Ethnic background. BME

unemployment in the city stands at almost 8 per cent compared to White unemployment of just over 4 per cent. The city's rate of young BME people not in employment, education or training (NEET's) has steadily decreased over the past seven years to just below 12 per cent however, this remains six per cent above their White counterparts.

The Baroness said: "It's important that our labour market is accessible to everybody and that we remove the barriers that have restricted BME talent for so long, and this review will identify how we can do that.

I am pleased that Bristol, a city with such a diverse population, has answered my call and invited me to engage with local businesses, charities and public bodies. If we are to deliver the long-term economic benefits of the Government's BME2020 plan then it is essential that we hear the views and experiences of employers themselves."

Bristol is also looking to learn from this meeting, being called Inclusive not Exclusive. Marvin Rees, Mayor of Bristol said: "Despite Bristol being one of the UK's most prosperous cities, the benefits of the strong local economy are not felt by all. I am as eager as the Baroness to hear the views of local employers on what they think are the barriers to developing BME talent and skills so I and other city leaders can work together to tear down those obstacles.

My priority is to make Bristol a more equal and inclusive city where everyone benefits and can contribute to the city's success. To do this and to ensure that no-one is left behind I will continue to work with partners to make Bristol a place where everyone has the opportunity to reach their potential irrespective of their background. We are already making progress through our Learning City Partnership, which has established a Race Equality in Education Steering Group with the aim of raising BME achievement in schools and reducing the numbers of young people not in employment, education or training."

If you would like this information in another language, Braille, audio tape, large print, easy English, BSL video or CD rom or plain text please contact: communications.marketing@bristol.gov.uk